

## CITY OF PALMERSTON

Minutes of Council Meeting  
held in MacKillop Catholic College,  
MacKillop Court, Palmerston  
On Tuesday 7 June 2016 at 6.30pm

**Ben Dornier**  
*Acting Chief Executive Officer*

Any member of Council who may have a conflict of interest, or a possible conflict of interest in regard to any item of business to be discussed at a Council meeting or a Committee meeting should declare that conflict of interest to enable Council to manage the conflict and resolve it in accordance with its obligations under the Local Government Act and its policies regarding the same.

### Audio Disclaimer

An audio recording of this meeting is being made for minute taking purposes as authorised by City of Palmerston Policy MEE3 Recording of Meetings, available on the Council Website.

## **1 PRESENT**

**Elected Members:** His Worship the Mayor Ian Abbott (Chair)  
Deputy Mayor Seranna Shutt  
Alderman Andrew Byrne  
Alderman Paul Bunker  
Alderman Geoff Carter  
Alderman Athina Pascoe-Bell

**Staff:** Ben Dornier, Acting Chief Executive Officer  
Mark Spangler, Director of Technical Services  
Silke Reinhardt, Minute Secretary

**Gallery:** Gerard Rosse, Manager Planning and Environment Services  
5 Members of the Public

## **2 APOLOGIES**

Alderman McKinnon – Apology

### **ACCEPTANCE OF APOLOGIES AND LEAVE OF ABSENCE**

Moved: Alderman Carter  
Seconded: Alderman Pascoe-Bell

THAT the apology received from Alderman McKinnon be received and granted.

CARRIED 8/2052-07/06/2016

## **3 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES**

---

Moved: Alderman Carter  
Seconded: Alderman Pascoe-Bell

1. THAT the minutes of the Council Meeting held Tuesday, 17 May 2016 pages 8574 to 8595, be confirmed.
2. THAT the Confidential minutes of the Council Meeting held Tuesday, 17 May 2016 pages 237 to 239, be confirmed.
3. THAT the minutes of the Special Council Meeting held Thursday, 19 May 2016 pages 8596 to 8599, be confirmed.
4. THAT the Confidential minutes of the Special Council Meeting held Thursday, 19 May 2016 pages 240 to 242, be confirmed.
5. THAT the minutes of the Special Council Meeting held Tuesday, 31 May 2016 pages 8600 to 8602, be confirmed.

CARRIED 8/2053-07/06/2016

## **4 MAYOR'S REPORT**

---

Nil

## **5 REPORT OF DELEGATES**

---

Nil

## **6 QUESTIONS (WITHOUT DEBATE) FOR WHICH NOTICE HAS BEEN GIVEN**

---

Nil

## **7 QUESTIONS (WITHOUT DEBATE) FOR WHICH NOTICE HAS NOT BEEN GIVEN**

---

Nil

## **8 PETITIONS**

---

Nil

## **9 DEPUTATIONS/PRESENTATIONS**

---

Nil

## **10 CONSIDERATION OF MOTIONS FOR WHICH NOTICE HAS BEEN GIVEN**

---

Nil

## **11 COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS**

---

### 11.1 Governance and Organisation

Nil

### 11.2 Economic Development and Infrastructure

Nil

### 11.3 Community Culture and Environment

*Alderman Carter declared a Conflict of Interest and left the room at 6.35pm.*

Moved: Deputy Mayor Shutt  
Seconded: Alderman Pascoe-Bell

THAT the minutes from the Community, Culture and Environment Committee meeting held on 1 June 2016 be received and noted and that Council adopts the recommendations made by the Committee and accordingly resolves as follows:-

#### 11.3.1 Breastfeeding Friendly Initiative

THAT a report be provided outlining possible breastfeeding friendly initiatives which Council could enact.

#### 11.3.2 Arafura Wind Ensemble Sponsorship

THAT Council sponsors the Arafura Wind Ensemble to the value of \$6000 excl. GST for four (4) performances in 2016/17 at Goyder Square.

CARRIED 8/2054-07/06/2016

*Alderman Carter returned to the room at 6.38pm.*

## 12 INFORMATION AGENDA

---

### 12.1 Items for Exclusion

Moved: Alderman Pascoe-Bell  
Seconded: Deputy Mayor Shutt

THAT item 12.3.1 'Action Report' be excluded from the Information Agenda for discussion.

CARRIED 8/2055-07/06/2016

### 12.2 Receipt of Information Reports

Moved: Alderman Bunker  
Seconded: Alderman Pascoe-Bell

THAT the information items contained within the Information Agenda, be received.

CARRIED 8/2056-07/06/2016

The Chair invited the Acting Chief Executive Officer and Director of Technical Services to provide a verbal update on the outstanding matters contained within the Action Report.

*Officers provided a verbal report to the meeting.*

## 13 DEBATE AGENDA

---

### 13.1 Officer Reports

#### 12.3.1 Action Report 8/0895

Moved: Alderman Byrne  
Seconded: Alderman Carter

1. THAT Council receives report number 8/0895.

CARRIED 8/2057-07/06/2016

Moved: Alderman Pascoe-Bell  
Seconded: Deputy Mayor Shutt

2. THAT Report Number 8/0895 be amended to indicate the Municipal Plan workshop has not yet been held.

MOTION LOST

**Minute Book Page 8607**

**12.3.1 Action Report (continued)**

**8/0895**

Moved: Deputy Mayor Shutt  
Seconded: Alderman Bunker

3. THAT a further workshop on the Municipal Plan will be scheduled for the 21 June 2016.

**CARRIED 8/2058-07/06/2016**

**13.1.1 Development Application (PA2016/0119) – Telecommunications facility with associated antennas and equipment shelter – Lot 9785 (30) Latram Court, Gunn**

**8/0896**

Moved: Alderman Bunker  
Seconded: Alderman Pascoe-Bell

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0896.
2. THAT the attachment to Report Number 8/0896 be endorsed.

**CARRIED 8/2059-07/06/2016**

**13.1.2 Development Application (PA2016/0301) – Change of use of part of site to Leisure and Recreation (Tenancies 9 & 10) – Lot 7167 (20) Essington Avenue, Gray (Sam's Dance Studio)**

**8/0897**

Moved: Alderman Bunker  
Seconded: Deputy Mayor Shutt

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0897.
2. THAT the attachment to Report Number 8/0897 be endorsed.

**CARRIED 8/2060-07/06/2016**

**Minute Book Page 8608**

- 13.1.3 Development Application (PA2016/0264) – Lot 4536 (11)  
University Avenue, Palmerston City – Alterations and additions to  
an existing hotel (Arch Rival Bar) 8/0898

Moved: Alderman Bunker  
Seconded: Alderman Carter

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0898.
2. THAT the attachment to Report Number 8/0898 be endorsed.

CARRIED 8/2061-07/06/2016

- 13.1.4 Development Application (PA2016/0303) Lot 4153 (36) Elrundie  
Avenue, Marlow Lagoon – Shed addition in excess of 8.5m in height  
(Satellite City BMX) 8/0899

Moved: Alderman Byrne  
Seconded: Alderman Bunker

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0899.
2. THAT the attachment to Report Number 8/0899 be endorsed.

CARRIED 8/2062-07/06/2016

- 13.1.5 Proposal to Amend NT Planning Scheme (PA2016/0169) – Low  
Risk, Low Impact Development Amendment 8/0900

Moved: Alderman Byrne  
Seconded: Alderman Bunker

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0900.

CARRIED 8/2063-07/06/2016

Moved: Alderman Byrne  
Seconded: Alderman Pascoe-Bell

2. THAT the attachment to Report Number 8/0900 be endorsed.

CARRIED 8/2064-07/06/2016

**Minute Book Page 8609**

**13.1.6 Proposal to Amend NT Planning Scheme (PA2016/0290) – Dual  
Occupancy in Zone SD (Single Dwelling Residential) 8/0901**

Moved: Alderman Pascoe-Bell  
Seconded: Alderman Byrne

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0901.

CARRIED 8/2065-07/06/2016

Moved: Alderman Pascoe-Bell  
Seconded:

2. THAT the attachment to Report Number 8/0901 be endorsed.

Motion lapsed for want of a seconder

Moved: Alderman Bunker  
Seconded: Deputy Mayor Shutt

3. THAT Council not support dual occupancy in Zone SD under the terms provided in the Proposal to Amend NT Planning Scheme (PA2016/0290) and that the letter to the Authority be amended to reflect such.

CARRIED 8/2066-07/06/2016

**13.1.7 Local Government Act Legislative Changes 8/0902**

Moved: Deputy Mayor Shutt  
Seconded: Alderman Carter

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0902.

CARRIED 8/2067-07/06/2016

Moved: Alderman Byrne  
Seconded: Deputy Mayor Shutt

2. THAT Council does not support the responsibility of conducting representation reviews being given to the NT Electoral Commission or any other body, and maintains the position that councils are best placed to determine their own constitutional arrangements as currently specified in the Local Government Act.
3. THAT Council supports the removal of conditional rating from the Local Government Act.

CARRIED 8/2068-07/06/2016

**Minute Book Page 8610**

13.1.7 Local Government Act Legislative Changes (continued) 8/0902

Moved: Alderman Byrne  
Seconded: Deputy Mayor Shutt

4. THAT a workshop be held 14 June 2016 regarding the Local Government Act legislative changes and how they affect the City of Palmerston.

CARRIED 8/2069-07/06/2016

13.1.8 PGA Tournament 8/0904

Moved: Alderman Byrne  
Seconded: Alderman Carter

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0904.

CARRIED 8/2070-07/06/2016

Moved: Deputy Mayor Shutt  
Seconded: Alderman Carter

2. THAT Council sponsor the PGA Championship Golf Tournament to be held on 11 August 2016 at the Palmerston Golf Course.
3. THAT Council sponsor the PGA Championship at the level of Tier 3 valued at \$30,000 with the proviso that should a Tier 2 sponsor for naming rights not be acquired, the naming rights automatically fall to Council.

CARRIED 8/2071-07/06/2016

Deputy Mayor Shutt called for a division – as a consequence the result of the above decision was set aside.

Upon dividing, 5 members voted in the affirmative, 1 member voted in the negative.

Members Voting in the Affirmative

Mayor Abbott  
Deputy Mayor Shutt  
Alderman Carter  
Alderman Byrne  
Alderman Bunker

Member Voting in the Negative

Alderman Pascoe-Bell

The Chair declared the motion CARRIED



13.1.9 Renewal Insurance Cover for Financial Year 2016/17

8/0905

Moved: Alderman Pascoe-Bell  
Seconded: Alderman Byrne

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0905.

CARRIED 8/2072-07/06/2016

Moved: Alderman Carter  
Seconded: Deputy Mayor Shutt

2. THAT Council extend agreement with Jardine Lloyd Thompson for the financial year 2016/17.
3. THAT Council procure insurance cover for the financial year 2016/17 through Jardine Lloyd Thompson.

CARRIED 8/2073-07/06/2016

## 14 CORRESPONDENCE

---

Nil

## 15 RESPONSE TO PREVIOUS QUESTIONS TAKEN ON NOTICE

---

Nil

## 16 PUBLIC QUESTION TIME

---

*At the invitation of the Chair*

Two questions were asked by Mark Owens, Marlow Lagoon resident on the draft Municipal Plan in relation to UCV and Concessions. The Chair invited Mr Owens to put his suggestions for improvements in a submission to Council.

## **17 OTHER BUSINESS**

---

### 17.1 Deputy Mayor Shutt

Provided a verbal report on recent activities attending the; International Hockey Open, National Heart Foundation NT Division Annual General Meeting, Radio Interview with Territory FM, workshop on Car Parking discussing the Municipal Plan, Chairing of a Special Council meeting, Palmerston Markets for Municipal Plan Community Engagement. Deputy Mayor advised she had recently been appointed as board member for the Palmerston Regional Committee for Top End Health Services.

### 17.2 Alderman Byrne

Provided feedback from the Palmerston Markets Municipal Plan Community Engagement held on Friday 3 June 2016, advising positive comments were received.

## **18 CONFIDENTIAL REPORTS**

---

Nil

## **19 CLOSURE**

---

Meeting closed at 8.31pm.

---

Chair

**CITY OF PALMERSTON**

**Minutes of Confidential Special Council Meeting  
held in Council Chambers, Civic Plaza, Palmerston  
on Tuesday, 19 May 2015 at 6.02pm**

**RELEASED TO THE PUBLIC RECORD**

---

**1. PRESENT**

- Elected Members:** His Worship the Mayor Ian Abbott (Chair)  
Deputy Mayor Sue McKinnon  
Alderman Geoff Carter  
Alderman Andrew Byrne  
Alderman Heather Malone  
Alderman Seranna Shutt
- Staff:** Ricki Bruhn, Chief Executive Officer  
Mark Spangler, Director of Technical Services  
Jan Peters, Acting Director of Corporate and Community Services  
Emily Fanning, Minute Secretary
- Gallery:** Gary Boyle, Major Projects Officer

**2. APOLOGIES**

Alderman Bunker – Apology

**ACCEPTANCE OF APOLOGIES AND LEAVE OF ABSENCE**

Moved: Alderman Malone  
Seconded: Deputy Mayor McKinnon

THAT the apology received from Alderman Bunker be received and granted.

**CARRIED 8/1515–19/05/2015**

**3. DEPUTATIONS / PRESENTATIONS**

Nil

**4. OFFICER REPORTS**

**4.1 TS2015-06 Goyder Square Stage 2 Construction – Contract Award 8/0668**

Moved: Alderman Shutt  
Seconded: Alderman Byrne

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0668.

**CARRIED 8/1516–19/05/2015**

**4.1 TS2015-06 Goyder Square Stage 2 Construction – Contract Award (continued)**

Moved: Alderman Carter  
Seconded: Alderman Byrne

2. THAT Council award Contract TS2015-06 Goyder Square Stage 2 Construction to BMD Urban for the indicated sum of \$4,938,264 (ex GST).
3. THAT Council delegates to the Mayor and Chief Executive Officer the power to sign and seal all required contract documentation for the Contract TS2015-06 Goyder Square Stage 2 Construction.
4. THAT the resolutions related to Report Number 8/0668 only be moved out of confidential into the open minutes of the Special Council meeting held on 19 May 2015.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY 8/1517–19/05/2015**

**5. MOVE TO OPEN**

Moved: Alderman Carter  
Seconded: Deputy Mayor McKinnon

THAT the Council move into the open session.

**CARRIED 8/1518–19/05/2015**

The meeting moved to the Open Session at 6.29pm

---

(Chair)

**ITEM NO.** 5.1                      **TS2015-06 Goyder Square Stage 2 Construction – Contract Award**

**FROM:**                              **Director of Technical Services**

**REPORT NUMBER:**              **8/0668**

**MEETING DATE:**                **19 May 2015**

---

**Municipal Plan:**

**2. Economic Development**

**2.3 City Planning**

2.3 We are committed to effective and responsible city planning which balances and meets both residential and commercial needs in our community

**Summary:**

The City of Palmerston called tenders for the construction of Goyder Square Stage 2 on the 2 April 2015 by public advertisement in the NT News and on the City of Palmerston website. Four conforming tenders and one non-conforming tender were received by close of tender at 2.00pm on 7 May 2015. The tender evaluation panel assessed the tenders and recommend that BMD Urban offers the best value for money. Council is asked to consider this report and:

- award Contract TS2015-06 Goyder Square Stage 2 Construction to BMD Urban for the indicated sum of \$4,938,264 (ex GST)
- delegate to the Mayor and Chief Executive Officer the power to sign and seal all required contract documentation for the Contract TS2015-06

**Background:**

Council decision 8/1455 of 17 March 2015 directed:

1. *THAT the Chief Executive Officer be delegated authority to commence an open tender process for Goyder Square Redevelopment Stage 2 once design work is finalised.*
2. *THAT Council seeks to complete Goyder Square Redevelopment Stage 2 project during the 2015 calendar year.*

The City of Palmerston called for tenders for the construction of Goyder Square Stage 2 on the 2 April 2015 by public advertisement in the NT News as required under the *Local Government (Accounting) Regulations*. Tenders were also advertised on the City of Palmerston website and Tenders.Net (Australasia).

Tender documentation was downloaded by 30 organisations as shown in **Attachment A**.

**General:**

Four conforming tenders and one non-conforming tender were received by close of tender at 2.00pm on 7 May 2015. No alternative tenders were offered. Conforming tenders are shown in Table 1:

**Table 1: Conforming tenders (in order of opening)**

Ref	Tenderer	Indicated Total *
1	Advance Civil	\$5,398,261.92
2	Wolpers and Grahl	\$7,870,072.96
3	Ciarla Constructions	\$6,321,013.01
4	BMD Urban	\$4,938,263.86

*\*All prices shown are GST exclusive*

A non-conforming tender was submitted by Norbuilt. The tender was considered non-conforming as it was:

- submitted after tender closing
- did not include the required electronic copy of tender (incorrect tender)
- did not include a schedule of rates (submitted later by email)

Conforming tenders were assessed on both price (50%) and non-price criteria (50%) including:

- Support for local industry
- Contractor's capacity, past performance and experience
- Contractor's ability to meet the timeframe

The Tender Assessment Panel considered that all contractors were capable of undertaking the works. Based on an assessment of the non-price and price criteria the tenderers were ranked (1 highest score) as:

1. BMD Urban
2. Advance Civil
3. Ciarla Constructions
4. Wolpers and Grahl

BMD Urban and Advance Civil were shortlisted for further consideration and were interviewed on 12 May 2015 and 13 May 2015 respectively. A brief analysis and comparison of the two tenders is shown in **Attachment B**. Both Contractors confirmed that provisional items (Table 2) could be deleted (individually or in total) without impacting the tendered schedule of rates.

**Table 2: Cost of provisional items as tendered by BMD Urban and Advance Civil**

Provisional Item	QS Estimate (revised)	BMD Urban	Advance Civil
Amenities	\$156,790	\$176,922	\$131,481
Playground	\$70,985	\$57,115	\$46,809
Water tower lighting	\$415,259	\$140,111	\$134,005
Sundries	\$38,632	\$3,162	\$4,572
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$681,669</b>	<b>\$377,311</b>	<b>\$316,868</b>

A local consultant was sought to undertake the role of Superintendent's Representative for the construction contract based on 20 hours per week for an expected construction period of 26 weeks. The indicated total consultancy price of \$97,300 (ex GST) is considered competitive.

### **Financial Implications:**

Council decision 8/1352 of 9 December 2014 approved in part:

*5. THAT Council set the construction cost target at \$4.5M (ex GST) excluding contingency for the Goyder Square (Stage 2) project.*

The pretender estimate of \$4.6M for the full scope of works was \$100,000 above the construction cost target (CCT). Following the receipt of tenders the quantity surveyor was requested to review the electrical and lighting components and the quantity surveyor has now increased the construction cost estimate to \$5.4M.

Funding for the construction of Goyder Square Stage 2 of \$5.65M has been included within Council's 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter budget review for consideration by Council with indicative project allocations of:

- \$0.125M consultancy contract (Superintendent's Representative)
- \$5.025M construction contract
- \$0.500M construction contingency of 10%

Table 1 shows the project costs associated with the short listed tenderers prices for the full scope of works and for a reduced scope of works without the provisional items.

**Table 1: Construction cost summary for short listed tenderers**

	<b>BMD Urban</b>		<b>Advance Civil</b>	
<b>Scope of works</b>	Full scope	No Provisional	Full scope	No Provisional
<b>Tendered</b>	\$4,938,264	\$4,621,396	\$5,398,262	\$5,020,951
<b>Contingency (10%)</b>	\$493,826	\$462,140	\$539,826	\$502,095
<b>Super's Rep</b>	\$125,000	\$125,000	\$125,000	\$125,000
<b>Total</b>	\$5,557,090	\$5,208,535	\$6,063,088	\$5,648,046

The BMD Urban and Advance Civil tenders are within the revised cost estimate prepared by the quantity surveyor.

A funding application for \$2M has been made to the Australian Government's National Stronger Regions Fund, however advice was received on 13 May 2015 that our application had been unsuccessful.

**Options:**

The options available to Council include:

- (a) Decline all tenders;
- (b) Accept the Advance Civil tender for the full scope of works at an indicated cost of \$5,398,262 and increase the project budget to \$6.06M;
- (c) Accept the Advance Civil tender without the provisional items at an indicated cost of \$5,020,951;
- (d) Accept the BMD Urban tender for the full scope of works at an indicated cost of \$4,938,264; or
- (e) Accept the BMD Urban tender without the provisional items at an indicated cost of \$4,621,396.

Option (d) is the preferred option as it will deliver the planned upgrades of the city centre.

Option (a) will not deliver the upgrades of the city centre planned by Council under the City Centre Master Plan.

Option (b) will deliver the planned upgrades of the city centre but would require a significant increase in the construction budget.

Option (c) will deliver most of the planned upgrades of the city centre within the construction budget but significantly over the CCT set by Council.

Option (d) will deliver the planned upgrades of the city centre within the construction budget but significantly over the CCT set by Council.

**Legislation / Policy:**

Section 29 of the *Local Government (Accounting) Regulations* require a council to publically call tenders for all works over \$100,000.

City of Palmerston Purchasing and Procurement Policy FIN04 sets out Council's processes for purchasing, including financial considerations for a purchase order to be raised.

City of Palmerston Delegations Manual authorises the Chief Executive in conjunction with the Mayor to execute contracts or other documents requiring the Common Seal.

**Risks:**

The highest areas of risk presented by the project to Council are expected to be financial risk, time for completion and public perception of Council.

Council has considered the need for financial constraint by setting an initial project target construction cost of \$4.5M. Increasing the project budget may place additional financial pressure on other Council budgets or projects and attract criticism from ratepayers.

It will be important for the selected contractor to deliver the project on time prior to increased rainfall as the wet season progresses and to avoid disrupting Christmas trading and activities planned for the city centre.

Public comments relating to the relocation of the markets indicate that many residents are not aware that Goyder Square Stage 2 is due to commence construction. A communications plan will be implemented to promote the project and provide



information to assist with managing trader, ratepayer and resident expectations and perceptions, commencing with a media release on the award of the tender.

**RECOMMENDATION**

1. THAT Council receives Report Number 8/0668.
2. THAT Council award Contract TS2015-06 Goyder Square Stage 2 Construction to BMD Urban for the indicated sum of \$4,938,264 (ex GST).
3. THAT Council delegates to the Mayor and Chief Executive Officer the power to sign and seal all required contract documentation for the Contract TS2015-06 Goyder Square Stage 2 Construction.
4. THAT the resolutions related to Report Number 8/0668 only be moved out of confidential into the open minutes of the special Council meeting held on 19 May 2015.

**Recommending Officer:** Mark Spangler, Director of Technical Services

Any queries on this report may be directed to Mark Spangler, Director of Technical Services on telephone (08) 8935 9958 or email [mark.spangler@palmerston.nt.gov.au](mailto:mark.spangler@palmerston.nt.gov.au).

Author: Gary Boyle, Major Projects Officer.

**Schedule of Attachments:**

- |               |   |
|---------------|---|
| Attachment A: | Organisations downloading the tender.                           |
| Attachment B: | Comparison and analysis of BMD Urban and Advance Civil tenders. |

-----Original Message-----

From: INFO | Tenders.Net [<mailto:info@tenders.net>]

Sent: Thursday, 7 May 2015 2:16 PM

To: Ben Dornier; Gary Boyle; Kylie Hendry

Subject: Closed Tender Notification

The following tender has now closed:

Tenders.Net Ref.: 844380

TS2015-06 - Goyder Square Stage 2 - Construction

Closing Date: 07/05/2015 - 02:00 PM Central Standard Time Tendering Firm: City of Palmerston

Electronic documentation:

The following suppliers downloaded documentation:

-----

Tenders.Net - Support

Support Officer

Ph: [02] 9747 1111

Fax: n/a

E-mail: [support@tenders.net](mailto:support@tenders.net)

Postal: n/a

-----

Carmichael Builders Pty Ltd

Katie Cosh

Ph: 07 4633 0955

Fax: 07 4633 7319

E-mail: [katie@carmichaelbuilders.com](mailto:katie@carmichaelbuilders.com)

Postal: n/a

-----

Gimbells Pty Ltd

Dan Orian

Ph: 89473666

Fax: 89844689

E-mail: [contracts@gimbells.com.au](mailto:contracts@gimbells.com.au)

Postal: n/a

-----

Paradise Landscaping (NT) Pty Ltd

Robert Helberg

Ph: 08 89472447

Fax: 08 89472448

E-mail: [info@paradisegroupnt.com.au](mailto:info@paradisegroupnt.com.au)

Postal: n/a

-----

Ostojic Group

Debbie Barbaro

Ph: 08 8999 9999

Fax: --

E-mail: [debbie.barbaro@ostojic.com.au](mailto:debbie.barbaro@ostojic.com.au)

Postal: n/a

Norbuilt Pty Ltd  
Gregory Thompson  
Ph: 0889800100  
Fax: 89812019  
E-mail: [tenders@norbuilt.com.au](mailto:tenders@norbuilt.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Goodline  
Scott Elliott  
Ph: 0437515513  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [tenders@goodline.com.au](mailto:tenders@goodline.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Nightcliff Electrical  
Tracey Jensen  
Ph: 08 8984 3955  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [admin@nightcliffelectrical.com.au](mailto:admin@nightcliffelectrical.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

BLACKBIRD Technology  
Huy Tran  
Ph: 0497627055  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [admin@blackbirdtech.com.au](mailto:admin@blackbirdtech.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Ertech EC Pty Ltd  
Rick Sage  
Ph: (08) 9302 6666  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [rick.sage@ertech.com.au](mailto:rick.sage@ertech.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Mark Cundall Earthmoving  
David Divilly  
Ph: 0439535292  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [david@mce.org.au](mailto:david@mce.org.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

K.A Civil Construction  
Adam Bowler  
Ph: 0423312730  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [a.m.bowler@hotmail.com](mailto:a.m.bowler@hotmail.com)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Allan King & Sons Constructions Pty Ltd

Allan King

Ph: 0889472087

Fax: 0889472097

E-mail: [darwin@aksc.net.au](mailto:darwin@aksc.net.au)

Postal: n/a

-----

Jmac Constrcutions

Greg LeBrocque

Ph: 0423799518

Fax: --

E-mail: [greg.lebrocque@jmacconstructions.com.au](mailto:greg.lebrocque@jmacconstructions.com.au)

Postal: n/a

-----

Innovative Office Furniture Pty Ltd

Allan Lodge

Ph: 0412658022

Fax: --

E-mail: [sales@iofnt.com.au](mailto:sales@iofnt.com.au)

Postal: n/a

-----

Territoria Civil

Jon Stringer

Ph: 08 89431000

Fax: 08 89471430

E-mail: [jon.stringer@territoriacivil.com.au](mailto:jon.stringer@territoriacivil.com.au)

Postal: n/a

-----

Lahey Constructions

Guy Tristram

Ph: 0408811790

Fax: --

E-mail: [gtristram@lahey.com.au](mailto:gtristram@lahey.com.au)

Postal: n/a

-----

The Breakthrough Group

Dave Mullins

Ph: 07 4038 8777

Fax: --

E-mail: [tenders@thebreakthroughgroup.com.au](mailto:tenders@thebreakthroughgroup.com.au)

Postal: n/a

-----

Brierty

Rebecca Hine

Ph: 08 9267 8077

Fax: --

E-mail: [business.development@brierty.com.au](mailto:business.development@brierty.com.au)

Postal: n/a

-----

BMD Urban Pty Ltd  
Geoff Holcombe  
Ph: 0423 003 269  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [geoffrey.holcombe@bmd.com.au](mailto:geoffrey.holcombe@bmd.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Advance Civil Engineering Pty Ltd  
Rick Grant  
Ph: 0889322704  
Fax: 0889323421  
E-mail: [info@advancecivil.com.au](mailto:info@advancecivil.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

RHINO INDUSTRIAL  
BRUCE PERRY  
Ph: +61889473400  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [admin@rhinoindustrial.com.au](mailto:admin@rhinoindustrial.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Ciarla Constructions Pty Ltd  
John Ciarla  
Ph: 040 547 6623  
Fax: 80 89329944  
E-mail: [ciarlaconstructions@bigpond.com](mailto:ciarlaconstructions@bigpond.com)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

H&K Earthmoving Pty Ltd  
Terry Doley  
Ph: 08 8988 1007  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [hnkearthmoving@arafura.net.au](mailto:hnkearthmoving@arafura.net.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Downer edi Works Pty Ltd  
Veronica Squire  
Ph: 08 89443600  
Fax: 08 89470197  
E-mail: [veronica.squire@downergroup.com](mailto:veronica.squire@downergroup.com)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

LIGHTNING ELECTRICAL SERVICES NT PTY LTD Scott Jenkins  
Ph: 0889843515  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [scott.jenkins@lightningelectrical.com.au](mailto:scott.jenkins@lightningelectrical.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Byrne Design  
Susannah Boer  
Ph: 0889472476  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [s.boer@bdd-nt.com.au](mailto:s.boer@bdd-nt.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Wolpers Grahl Pty Ltd  
Mark Innes  
Ph: 0889477600  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [tendering@wg.net.au](mailto:tendering@wg.net.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Top End Development Civil  
Claire Bignell  
Ph: 0429922430  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [claire.bignell@tedcivil.com.au](mailto:claire.bignell@tedcivil.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

HG Industries  
Mark Wilkes  
Ph: 0477959259  
Fax: --  
E-mail: [markjw@live.com.au](mailto:markjw@live.com.au)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

D.J. Hire Pty Ltd  
Dennis McDonald  
Ph: 0889474768  
Fax: 0889474054  
E-mail: [djhire@bigpond.com](mailto:djhire@bigpond.com)  
Postal: n/a  
-----

Electronic submission:  
No electronic submission was made available for this tender.

Kind regards,  
Tenders.Net Team  
Australia: 1300 307 308  
New Zealand: 0800 447 191  
International: +61 2 9747 1111  
Email: [info@tenders.net](mailto:info@tenders.net)  
Web: [www.tenders.net](http://www.tenders.net)

## ATTACHMENT B

## GOYDER SQUARE STAGE 2 - SHORTLISTED TENDERER COMPARISON

Table 1: Comparison and analysis of BMD Urban and Advance Civil tenders

Component	BMD Urban	Advance Civil
Scope of Works <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Capability</li> <li>• Construction sequencing</li> <li>• Provisional items</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Experience, capacity and capability to deliver the scope of works</li> <li>• Intend to fence the complete site – not considered practicable. CoP will need to work with BMD on traffic and pedestrian management</li> <li>• Tendered program does not complete concrete until last – potential for wet weather impacts</li> <li>• Provisional items will not impact scheduled items</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Experience, capacity and capability to deliver the scope of works</li> <li>• Intend to work in stages – provides better options for maintaining access to shops and for pedestrians</li> <li>• Provisional items will not impact scheduled items</li> </ul>
Cost <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scheduled items</li> <li>• Provisional items</li> <li>• Tendered price</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• \$4,621,396</li> <li>• \$ 316,868</li> <li>• \$4,938,264</li> <li>• Deleting provisional items will not impact tendered price for scheduled items</li> <li>• Significant number but predominantly client driven by to Goyder Square interface/changes</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• \$5,020,951</li> <li>• \$ 377,311</li> <li>• \$5,398,262</li> <li>• Deleting provisional items will not impact tendered price for scheduled items</li> </ul>
Date for Completion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Submitted program showing completion by the required 27 Nov 15</li> <li>• Need to reschedule some works to provide better surety of completing on time</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Did not submit a program with tender but have committed to completion by the required 27 Nov 15</li> </ul>
Quality Assurance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Quality of works on The Boulevard was adequate but not of the required standard for Goyder Square – may require additional effort from CoP to ensure quality achieved</li> <li>• QA documentation adequate on Boulevard but could be improved</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Previous jobs such as Stokes Hill Wharf indicate ability to achieve the required quality</li> </ul>

Risk management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Assessed as increased risk to CoP             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Time – possible delays due to wet weather</li> <li>Political - traffic and pedestrian access</li> <li>Quality – require additional CoP effort to manage</li> <li>Cost – potential for higher number of variations</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Referee report indicated no perceived additional risks</li> </ul>
Communication	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Boulevard – generally acceptable level of ability to interact positively with 3<sup>rd</sup> party stakeholders such as cafes, however some issues arose. Tavern was happy with level of operational communications</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Referee report indicated ability to interact positively with 3<sup>rd</sup> party stakeholders such as cafes</li> </ul>
Referee comment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not sought – direct previous CoP experience with The Boulevard</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>John Kassaras – NTG DOI – verbal 15 May 15</li> <li>Time – agreed target dates achieved. Timeliness of response to client requests for quotes could be improved</li> <li>Quality – concrete finish acceptable, some subcontractor QA documentation lacking</li> <li>Cost – competitive</li> <li>Variations – significant number but predominantly client driven by project requirements</li> <li>Public interaction - proactive and managed well, worked well with shops to resolve any construction issues such as noise and dust</li> <li>Had to follow up documentation / request for quotes</li> <li>Overall – generally happy – did well</li> </ul>